



**2008 Clinton Global Initiative Annual Meeting
Education Working Session: Global Expansion of Programs
that Increase Quality Education: Part 2
Clinton Global Initiative
September 24, 2008**

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

[START RECORDING]

LYNN MURPHY: Sounds like you have been having lively discussions out there, and we got some excellent questions from all of you to return and ask our panelists. So, I am going to start with Rukmini again. You have been able to take some very unsexy things, like impact evaluations, randomized control trials, data, and turn it into very sexy ways to scale, and I would like for you to talk a little bit about the role of information and doing that work and scaling your model.

RUKMINI BANERJI: So, do I have half an hour?

[Laughter]

LYNN MURPHY: You have got a minute.

RUKMINI BANERJI: I think making data sexy is not hard. I want to just give you a very short story, because I think stories illustrate the point. You can cut me off as soon as the story gets boring. When you go to a village and you start talking to people about education, immediately the conversation goes to, my child did not get this, and, the teacher did not come, and blah-blah-blah, and so on.

Whereas, when you go to a village and you actually do an activity, for example, getting kids to read, the entire dynamic seems to change, and village after village when you do this, one of the things we realized is that data becomes, I do not know about sexy, but data becomes interesting when

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

you are generating something that you did not know before.

So, if you go and say, does your child go to school, the whole village knows who goes to school and who does not go to school. Does the teacher come to school? Well, everybody knows that already. It is only you who do not. So, if you are going to create something that is interesting, you have to generate the point that the people concerned have not found that out before, and secondly, you have to be able to create a curiosity to figure out the next step.

So, I think what we have done is basically taken something like this, something that was not known. So, again, in terms of access, the government has lots of figures. You know, there is MDG, there's all kinds of things, but this whole business of how many children can read and can my child read and can my neighbor's child read.

This whole exercise, I think, by actually doing this on the ground and creating the interest and the curiosity, that is what made it, I mean, you are calling it sexy; we will go back to India and say, now we are sexy, but, you know, so far it was just interesting because it was something that was not known before.

LYNN MURPHY: If I am allowed, as I am moderator, to add a p.s. on that, Pratham's willingness to do an impact evaluation and actually open up their model to have rigorous impact evaluation and data generated out of it was part of

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

what was very convincing for Hewlett and Gates to support their model to take it to scale.

Okay, with that, I am gonna ask Maria, one of the questions that came was: Why can kids and Molly not read after six years of schooling? Is it teacher training? Is it materials? Is it other factors? But just your own assessment of why is it that these schools are failing children, even in the basics of learning to read?

MARIA KEITA DIARRA: I said sort of that teacher training, the quality of the teacher training is a problem in Mali, and also, if only 20 children do not spend enough time at school, when you look at the instructional time and teacher gets—

LYNN MURPHY: Meaning they are absent a lot?

MARIA KEITA DIARRA: Yes, absent, these, yes. And we have the big thing that you cannot read when you are a child of seven years old, your first reading language can be your foreign language. So, those combined, those thing combined make our kids not able to read.

LYNN MURPHY: So, foreign language, teachers not in the classroom, and the overall preparation of them before they get to the classroom. Okay.

MARIA KEITA DIARRA: That is, I think, needed.

LYNN MURPHY: Combined solutions.

MARIA KEITA DIARRA: Yes.

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

LYNN MURPHY: Michelle, you mentioned earlier that you had put money on the table as an incentive to try to get teachers to improve their performance and push the accountability agenda forward. What other incentives have you used to negotiate with the teacher's unions, or what other strategies have you been using to really drive forward this accountability agenda?

MICHELLE RHEE: We have done a lot in terms of ensuring that teachers understand that we are also very interested in ensuring that they have the professional development and the support that they need. As the culture within public education becomes more and more data driven in the country, what we know is that our teachers are very ill-equipped in terms of actually using that data and then using that data to inform their instruction moving forward.

So, the idea that we would have more robust professional development, better mentoring for new teachers who are coming into the system, and that sort of thing, have definitely helped. I think though that people often ask me, what is the thing that is going to allow us to recruit and retain the highest quality teachers overall, and I will say that without a doubt the best strategy for doing that is ensuring that you have higher quality teachers overall, because the people, the group of people who are most adamantly in support of me moving out the ineffective

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

teachers are the truly effective teachers.

They are so tired of being in a system where they get paid the exact same amount of money as the person down the hall who is doing absolutely nothing, where the kids might be moving backwards and they are moving their kids two or three grade levels forward. That is incredibly frustrating as a professional.

So, those are the teachers who are saying to us, 'you know what? We absolutely have to change the system that we have in place, to ensure that we have the best people' because they want to be in environments. They are not in it for the money. I mean, everyone knows that. But they want to be in environments where they know that the other people that they are collaborating with are of as high quality and caliber as they are.

LYNN MURPHY: Okay, as you all can see, the clock is ticking, but I want to ask you one last question and each of you to respond. So, if donors in the room could provide funds for one thing to help your program or your community, what would it be? You have got 30 seconds. No. [Laughter] Anybody jump in.

MARIA KEITA DIARRA: Okay. One thing for us would be useful is to have a literate environment. We are talking about children reading, but in Mali there is no literate environment. The only written things we can see are maybe

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

some advertising in French.

LYNN MURPHY: So, you mean books that are actually in their local languages and reading materials for the kids.

MARIA KEITA DIARRA: Yes, literate environment. Yes.

RUKMINI BANERJI: I would agree with Maria. We do have more things, but we do not have enough for early-grade reading for children, and if you have 200 million children, you need at least 200 million titles, because once children begin to read, they are like demons. They will read up everything.

So, you need to have a continuous supply of appropriate, meaning at the right level, stuff for kids. So, it is not just a production issue. It is a huge distribution issue to get supplies out to schools as fast as children can read it. So, if there is anybody in this room who wants to do it, we are willing to talk to you.

LYNN MURPHY: And Michelle?

MICHELLE RHEE: So, I am going to cheat and say two things. One would be that we are still thinking funding for our ability to actually implement this differentiated pay contract, and I think it is going to really sort of change the game in this country about the teaching profession, if we can move this contract forward. I would say the second thing is that we are about to undertake an initiative that is a very aggressive parental advocacy campaign.

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

Right now in the district we have a situation where a lot of the parents of our children do not have the sort of knowledge and information that they need to be effective advocates for their children. So, as I was closing down 23 schools across the city, we had parents picketing and fighting me and yelling at me, when in fact their school is such an underperforming school, where only 10-percent of the kids are proficient or advanced, but the parents are sort of fighting me to keep the school open.

So, we believe that we— it is incumbent upon us to educate and empower the parents with good data and good information so that when only 10-percent of the kids in that school are performing at grade level, that they are coming in to picket my office to shut that school down and to provide them with better options, not the other way around.

LYNN MURPHY: So, we heard information, funding for the salary, and a lot about materials, all the way from development, production, distribution.

So, I just want to take— we are actually— we have a moment. I want to take an opportunity and just really thank our panelists. I felt very privileged to be able to moderate this, to ask questions of three inspiring women who have really been innovators in their countries, who have been leaders for education reform; and again, instead of leaning away from such a daunting problem, they have leaned right

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

into it and found ways that they can actually improve what kids are learning in the classroom, and they have found very innovative ways to scale that. So, my own thanks for that.

[Applause]

MALE SPEAKER: No, no, no, no, no, no. So, let me just mention, we have a few, as we always do at Clinton Global Initiative, a few commitments, and first, I just wanted to mention just a couple more ideas that came from the table, and just wanted to put them out there.

One common theme at the table discussions was, particularly in developing country context, but also in the U.S., is the education of the parent, that educating mothers now as adults was a critical ingredient for improving quality.

A second theme that came up a bit was whether we have enough kind of leadership academies or specifically for principals, and I want to flag that because on Friday, Jon Schnur, who runs New Leaders For New Schools, is going to talk about what they are doing for teachers in, for creating a generation of principals who Michelle Rhee can hire to lead innovative, high-quality public schools. So, that will be our Friday morning breakfast innovation panel.

Another thing that came up a bit was the idea of a contract, signing a contract with parents or getting people to make commitments to certain types of things that they are

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

doing. The table that was way over-influenced by being with an NBA star, Kevin Johnson, came back with their three-point play, but I think it reflected a lot of them, which is, engage principles, high-quality teachers and parents who are motivated contractually otherwise to be involved.

And then the last point that came up was the recreating the wheel part, whether we really, even in the U.S. or in developing countries, really, really know when you are expanding quality, do we really, really have systems data ways that people really understand how things work. And I am going to say one thing about that. I think this is a place where you need human contact.

I think the whole idea you put up successful models on the internet, et cetera, I just have to tell you, I have been doing all this, I have been working this for years, I think what helps you is when somebody comes and sits down with your team and says, let me tell you what we did in our country, in our city, and people ask the question. So, I think if we are talking about sharing quality data, we have got to go back to old-fashioned, more face-to-face consulting.

With that, I want to— one of the things we are doing this year that feeds of what we did at lunch is that at every session we are going to do a progress report, at least one progress report, and this again comes from the notion that we

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

want to see the continuity, what people are doing.

So, we have one here and then just a couple of announcements, and it is Brenda Musilli, Worldwide Director of Education at Intel Corporation, she leads their \$100 million annual global commitment to accelerate math, science, and engineering education, and Brenda, would you like to come up and give a short progress report of the Intel commitment?

BRENDA MUSILLI: Thank you. It is a rather humbling task to follow the panel that was up here today talking on a topic that is very passionate to my heart and to Intel. On behalf of Intel and the Intel Foundation, I am just really happy to be here today to have a chance to just update you on how we are doing on our teacher training commitment that we made last year.

Before I do that though, I just want to mention that our commitment to teachers goes back to the beginning of our company. This year is the 40th anniversary of Intel, which is hard to believe. I have been there a lot of that time, so it is really hard to believe. But starting at the beginning of our company, we made a very big commitment to education, believing that education is the way that we can give back to the world in the most powerful way.

And as we have been discussing here at the Clinton Global Initiative, just about any problem you can think of can be solved through education. So, we are very committed

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

to this.

About ten years ago, our chairman, Craig Barrett, who is really world-renowned for his views on education and how to alleviate poverty in the world, had a vision that we would go train teachers as a way to really give back to the world and as a way to help teachers be effective in the classroom. And he has a very famous saying that has been used many times since that point in time ten years ago, that "we believe that computers are not magic, it is the teachers that are the magic."

And so, with that vision, he made a commitment on that time, on behalf of Intel, to go train 100,000 teachers in the world, and it seemed like a daunting task at the time. And since that point, we have trained over five million teachers around the world in over 40 countries. And it is really staggering for me to even think about it. I am pleased and honored to have been a part of a good part of that in the last four years.

But last year we were very honored to be a part of the Clinton Global Initiative, and I was here with Craig, where we made an important commitment in the next phase of our teacher training, which was to go train a-million-and-a-half teachers in 15 countries in a new online teacher professional development model. This is very critical. It is a critical way that we are going to scale teacher

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

professional development out over the next five to ten years, and we are getting started in a very big way.

I was asked to just talk about the challenges; there have been many. Our progress is good. We have translated the teacher training in the standard face-to-face model into online in 40 countries. We have piloted and we are doing evaluation now in over half of those 15 countries we committed to.

The challenges are many as we work with teachers - on who is ready for online training, as we work with governments, as we work with infrastructure. But we are very committed to deliver the million-and-a-half teachers over the next five years in online, as well as continuing to do the face-to-face models where that makes sense in developing countries. So, we are very pleased about that.

Just a brief word about something that I think you will find very interesting and exciting - a new commitment that we are making today from Intel, which is, I just want to hold it up because I think this is going to tell the whole story in a show-and-tell model, just like in school: the eGranary Digital Library. This is just an incredible new capability. Intel is working with WiderNet of the University of Iowa, and I am pleased to introduce Cliff Missen, who is sitting over here at the table up front.

You may want to talk to him at the end of the session

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

today. This digital library is bringing internet content to communities, schools, hospitals around the world that do not have internet access. It is incredible. You know, 80-percent of the population still does not have access to the internet today.

This little box right here has 1,200 websites and CD-ROMs. It provide 10 million documents, and it is- we have currently got this installed in, what, 25 locations in a number of different countries. Hopefully this time next year it will be so many more than it is today. So, if you are interested in finding out more about this or how you can get one yourself, which was one of my questions, please talk to Cliff at the end of the session or to me here over the next couple of days.

Again, thank you, and again, it is just our honor and pleasure on behalf of Intel to be here and to be in a room with people who share the same passion for education and teacher training and helping all the people in the world to come into the knowledge economy. So, thank you again. [Applause]

MALE SPEAKER: First commitment we wanted to announce is from Humana People to People, and Marie Lichtenberg, if she could come up. I think one of the big issues in expanding access and quality is teachers, and those of us who work on reaching the millennium goal know that would mean 18 million new teachers by 2015, and Humana People to People has come through very big at the Clinton Global Initiative with four

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

commitments.

I am going to talk about the two to education. They are creating four new teacher training colleges in Malawi, that they believe over time will reach and affect the quality of one million students. They are also partnering with the government of Mozambique, even with the president of Mozambique and the first lady, to increase girls' education by providing 2,000 scholarships for young women to become qualified primary school teachers, and these two education commitment total over \$20 million. And so, we are very, very grateful for this commitment. Thank you. [Applause]

And then, tomorrow, one of the things that will be happening, that Clinton Global Initiative is involved in, is a very large announcement with heads of state, CEOs. It is being called the class of 2015 pledge, to bring lots of different groups into the advocacy world of advocating for universal education.

I have a different hat I wear sometimes, which is the Chair of the U.S. Global Campaign for Education, and I have some great partners in crime that work on bringing forward the message to policy makers that we reach that goal, and we have to do it in the U.S. as well. And so, I would like Joann Carter, the new Executive Director of Results; Paul Zeitz, the Executive Director of Global Aids Alliance; and their top education person, David Gartner.

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

They are pledging to, in this very critical year, commit to doing a new advocacy initiative to launch at a higher level, to reach universal education and support a new global initiative or new global fund to get us to the goal of universal education, and I will say that it is very interesting that we said on our third panel we are going to bring health and education together.

Well, these are two organizations that did not need us to do that panel; Results is a broad-based poverty group. They have seen that connection and been champions of education, and Global Aids Alliance is really one of the top very few partners in education, because they saw very early that if you cared about HIV/Aids, you had to care about universal education. So, we thank them for their commitment. [Applause]

Thank you. Some people wear a lot of different hats. Mesa Jalbooth [misspelled?], I have known in a few different capacities. She used to be, in terms of advocacy, the person in the Canadian government who listened, who cared, who really worked with the NGO community, was a real partner. So, it was a loss but a gain when she became the director of research and strategic planning for Queen Rania, a great, great champion of girls in universal education.

And they, Madrasati means my school, and the Queen, through the Jordan River Foundation, with Cisco and the Jordan Education Initiative, is outfitting 500 madra sati schools with

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

computers and interactive white boards in the classroom, and set up these classrooms with wireless networks that will improve the quality of education for children throughout Jordan.

This will also provide these schools with teachers with the training they need to improve the sustainable use of this technology. This is valued at 25 million over five years. Mesa herself and the Queen, they are not in this for the short term. They are at everything. They are leading all of the private sector-public sector efforts. So, on behalf of Mesa and Queen Rania, thank you very much for this commitment.

[Applause]

Seth Waugh, CEO of Deutsche Bank Americas; Jay Kimmelman, New Globe Schools; Steve Hardgrave from Gray Matters. Deutsche Bank, along with its partners, is working to strengthen the reach of low-cost private schools to reach poor children in communities that would have no access to education right now.

They will train the teachers and principals and school leaders and help to improve the management of resources to ensure that these schools are accountable and run smoothly. Over the next two years, they are pledging to schools that will affect 100,000 poor children in India and Kenya, valued at eight million over two years, and you see with this as well as what Queen Rania is doing, people really taking the holistic

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

approach, from access to teacher quality to the technology.

Thank you very much for your commitment. [Applause]

And finally, Coricki [misspelled?], the organization, Dr. Barbara, Bobbie Kershin [misspelled], the executive director of Coricki. Coricki has been able to secure too many partners to name here, which is a good problem, but Coricki and their partners commit to build a huge repository of free, high-quality, open-source educational recourses. They are making sure the communities can create and share high-quality educational material so that they can leverage each others' knowledge and expertise.

This innovative open sourcing of education will expand and develop learning opportunities for millions of teachers and students worldwide, and we thank you for being part with so many partners in this Clinton Global commitment. [Applause]

We are unquestionably trying to fit in a lot of people because we really care so much about everybody who makes an education commitment here, and we just think being able to see people with your own eyes and see their commitment, the more we do that, the more not just recognition we give, but the more partnerships are created.

Before we go, I just want to let you know what is going on tomorrow morning. One of the new things also was people said they would like more informal ability to kind of partner and network with groups of their choice, and so, we took your

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

comments and thoughts, and based on that, there will be from 7:45 to 8:45 tomorrow morning, and I will be up there, at the Empire East and Empire West room in the second floor, we will be doing working group chairs. There are no— this is not formal, but we are going to have breakfast table topics, and they are technology and education.

The organizations that suggested that topic were Microsoft and Coricki, as you can understand. Education for girls and women who do not have access to education, Pyramis Global Advisors, Blank Rome, some of the people suggested it. Early childhood education, global fund for education, Cindy and Anda [misspelled?] Adams on my staff; the education for orphans and vulnerable children, FXB International and the Whole Child Institute suggested that.

Five, education of HIV/Aids, we will be talking about that with Beatrice Wear [misspelled?] in our third panel, but Nakia AIDS Orphan School [misspelled?] wanted to do a table on that. Entrepreneurship education, NFTE, an organization I work closely with; Agora Partnership, Nicaragua. Seven, education reform for the future, teachers training and improving quality. I think we got a good jumpstart there.

And the Visa Low Institute World China Education Foundation [misspelled?], Humana, Center for Evolutionary Neuroscience. Eight, education for rural children. Nine, education and service learning for youth empowerment; James

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.

Richardson and Son, YPOWL president to Action Network, Capital Corporations; and finally, education, religion, and peace in the Muslim world. We have a very interesting commitment from Margara Cone [misspelled?] on Friday about this, but Radiant Group, Eli and Edythe - the Broad Foundation, and others.

So, we just wanted to let you know that we are trying to listen. We will see how this goes. We will get with the feedback. Maybe we will do it a little different, but it is a chance for people to comment a little bit more and formally network on some of the topics that we will not get to mention.

And if somebody could figure out a way to actually expand the Sheraton to have more rooms, we could do way better breakfast than this, but this is our limitation now. So, thank you very much for our first day on the education side.

[Applause] And we will see you tomorrow. Thank you very much.

MALE SPEAKER: Table facilitators, please join Paige at the back of the room for your debriefing. A.S., table facilitators, meet Paige at the back of the room.

[END RECORDING]

¹ kaisernetwork.org makes every effort to ensure the accuracy of written transcripts, but due to the nature of transcribing recorded material and the deadlines involved, they may contain errors or incomplete content. We apologize for any inaccuracies.